

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Limited
(Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Government of India)

Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) on 25.07.2020 to evaluate the Technical bids for Consultancy services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of:

(i) Construction of two lane with hard shoulder of Kohima-Jessami Road on NH-29 (Old NH-150) from existing km 76.320 (near Mesulumi Village) to existing km 98.380 (near Chizami Village) [Design Length - 22.06 Km] in the state of Nagaland Under Bharatmala Pariyojna on EPC Mode (Package IV)

(ii) Construction of two lane with hard shoulder of Kohima-Jessami Road on NH-29 (Old NH-150) from existing km 98.380 (near Chizami Village) to existing km 120.367 (Nagaland/Manipur Border) [Design Km 95.700 to Design Km 117.200] [Design Length – 21.500 Km] in the state of Nagaland Under Bharatmala Pariyojna on EPC Mode (Package V).

1. ETBC had opened the Technical bids on 23.06.2020. Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) met on 25.07.2020 to evaluate the proposals as per the terms of RFP document.

2. It was appraised that:

- a) As per clause 4.1 of Section-2 of RFP, bidders are required to submit their Technical Proposal only through online mode i.e. via CPP portal and INFRACON portal and no separate hard copy was required to submit.
- b) The details of firms are as under:

Sr. No	Name of Consultant	Type of Venture	Lead Member (or Sole)	Other Member (JV/ Associate)
1	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd.	Sole	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd.	-
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with M S Consultant	Association	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited	M/s M S Consultant
3	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MPG Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	Association	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MPG Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited- M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited (JV)	JV	M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited	M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited
5	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd	Sole	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd	-
6	SA Infra in association with Upham International Corporation	Association	SA Infra	Upham International Corporation
7	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited	Sole	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited	-

- c) As per the Section-3 & 4 of RFP, the bidders were required to upload the Experience of the firm and List of the proposed Key personnel & Summary of CVs Particulars on INFRACON Portal. Whereas, Site Appreciation, Approach paper on methodology for performing the assignment, Facility for field investigation and testing, Time schedule for deployment of Professional staff and Activity (works) schedule were required to be uploaded on CPP Portal.
- d) Based on the credential submitted by the bidders on CPP Portal and INFRACON Portal, Evaluation of bids has been carried out manually as certain new parameters like Experience in use of technology for road inspection was added in the Model RFP and INFRACON Portal is not upgraded with the present Model RFP.

3. The Committee noted that the Consultant had submitted their Technical Proposal on e-Procurement Portal i.e. on CPP Portal & INFRACON portal and the evaluation has been carried out based on the details submitted by bidders. The proposals were examined as per Section-2 (Letter of Invitation to Consultants) Data Sheet of RFP Document.

4. The Committee noted that as per clause 3.4 (x) (f) of Section-2 (Letter of Invitation to Consultants) of RFP Document, *"If a CV score less than 75% marks, whatever marks it score will be carried forward for maximum 3 nos. key personnel for determining the total score of the firm. However, if the Key Personnel does not fulfill the minimum academic qualification (as mentioned at Enclosure-B of TOR of RFP), the overall score of his CV will be evaluated as zero. If the Key Personnel does not fulfill the minimum qualification related to experience (as mentioned at Enclosure-B of TOR of RFP), then zero marks will only be assigned for that sub criteria, but the marks obtained by the CV of the Key Personnel will be carried forward for maximum 3 nos. key personnel for determining the total score of the firm. In case, a firm is H-1, then all such Key Personnel (whose CV scores less than 75% or who does not fulfill the minimum qualification) will have to be replaced by the firm before signing the contract. The reduction in remuneration of such replacements shall be 10% for each replacement. In case more than 3 CV scores less than 75% marks or Team leader cum Senior Pavement Engineer scores less than 75% marks, the proposal shall be considered non-responsive"*.

5. Further, the committee was apprised that Shri Shankar Mishra had forwarded an Affidavit claiming the email ID mithileshm168@gmail.com used to submit a CV on Infracon does not belong to him. Shri Shankar Mishra has been proposed by M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd. for Senior Pavement Specialist having the aforesaid Email ID. Since the Key personal has denied the above Email ID, hence zero marks have been awarded to M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd. for the CV of Senior Pavement Specialist.

6. Shri Ramesh Chandra Bhardwaj has been proposed as Team Leader by M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd. Shri Ramesh Chandra Bhardwaj's age as on the bid due date was 64 years 11 month and 7 days. However since as per clause 12.2 of the ToR, *"The age of the Key Personnel should not be more than 65 years on the date of submission of proposal"* Since the age of the personal proposed is less the 65 years at the time of bid due date, the CV has therefore been accepted by the evaluation committee.

7. In the clause 23 of Section 1 (Information to consultants) regarding Participation of Consultant in bidding process of NHIDCL, it is stated that

The bidder either as individual firm or in JV or in association, who are having (three) or more on – going Authority's Engineer Consultancy Contract(s) in NHIDCL, as on date of bid submission, shall not be eligible to bid for this Authority's Engineer Consultancy Contract (Issuance of LOA will be considered as an on-going Authority's Engineer Consultancy contracts).

AND

The bidder shall not be awarded more than 3 (three) Authority's Engineer Consultancy Contracts for current bidding process in NHIDCL

(ii) It was brought to the notice of the committee that, M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited has been declared as H1 bidder in 2 Projects of Manipur and 1 project in Arunachal Pradesh is already ongoing. As such M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited has 3 AE contracts as on 29.07.2020 and hence the evaluation committee has decided to declare M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited as non-responsive for further project as per clause 23 of Section 1.

8. The committee observed that in the details of turnover required to be submitted for evaluation as per Section 3 of the RFP is for 2019-20, 2018-19 & 2017-18. However, all the bidders have submitted the financial turnover of 2018-19, 2017-18 & 2016-17 only as the tender bid due date was 22.07.2020 which was before the last day of submission for filing of taxes. The accounts can be audited only after the filing of the same. Further the accounts finalization at their part seems to be delayed due to COVID Pandemic and I.T Department, GOI has extended tax filing deadline till Sep 2020. Accordingly, keeping in view the extraordinary COVID situation, the committee has decided to accept the FY 2018-19, 2017-18 & 2016-17 for evaluation of the bid.

9. Accordingly, the detailed evaluation sheets are enclosed at Annexure A.

10. In its evaluation, the committee observed that the participating firms as mentioned above in para 2(b) are technically qualified in terms of provisions of RFP. The Technical score of the firms are as under :

Sl. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience of the firm (Total Score 40)	Evaluation criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection (Total Score 20)	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment (Total Score 40)	Total Score (Total Score 100)	Projects with NHIDCL
1	M/s Geo Designs and Research Pvt. Ltd.	40	17	31.30	88.30	0
2	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Limited in association with M/s M S CONSULTANT	40	Technically Non responsive			3
3	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MPG Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.	40	19	37.10	96.10	1
4	M/s Marc Technocrats Private Limited- M/s G Eng Advisory Services Private Limited (JV)	40	20	36.22	96.22	0
5	M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd	38.75*	15	36.88	90.63	1

6	SA Infra in association with Upham International Corporation	40	20	36.10	96.10	1
7	M/s Theme Engineering Services Private Limited	40	20	35.37	95.37	0


* The UDIN of M/s Planning & Infrastructural Development Consultants Pvt. Ltd has been found missing and the same may be submitted within 7 days along with comments if any.


11. It was also observed by the committee that M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in association with M/s MPG Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. has proposed the same team as was proposed by them for Consultancy services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Package 1,2 & 3. Accordingly, if awarded the project, they shall be declared non responsive in this package.

12. In view of the above, ETEC has decided to ask the bidders to submit their comments within 7 days as per Clause 10 (vii) data sheet of RFP by uploading Technical Score on website.

13. Finance has evaluated Annual Turnover and associated marks only.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to Chair.


Ajay Ahluwalia
(ED-V)
Convener


AK Jha,
GM(T)
Member


Vivekananda Jaiswal
DGM (T)
Member


Bhaskar Mallick
Man (Finance)
Member